Referred to (mittee on Judiciary Branch Novembor 15, 1955 51

Constitutional Convention of Alaska

- i -

PROPOSAL 1

Introduced by R. E. Robertson CCURTS, JUDICIAL, TENURE, AND JURIES.

RISOLVED, that the following be agreed upon as part of the Alaska State Constitution. 1 1. The judicial power of the State of Alaska shall be 2 vested in one Supreme Court, and in one Superior Court, and in 3 such inferior Courts as the Legislature may from time to time 4 ordain and establish. The Judges of the Supreme and Superior 5 Court shall hold their offices during good behavior and for 6 life until reaching the retirement age prescribed by the 7 Legislature, and they as well as the Judges of the inferior Ś Courts shall, at stated times, receive for their services 9 a compensation which shall not be diminished during their 10 continuance in office. The Supreme Court shall consist of the 11 Chief Justice and of not less than two Associate Justices.

12 2. The judicial power shall extend to all cases, in law, 13 equity and probate, and to all criminal cases, arising under this Constitution and the laws of the State of Alaska. The 14 15 Supreme Court shall have appellate jurisdiction in all cases, 16 both as to law and fact, with such exceptions and under such 17 regulations is the Legislature shall ordain, but shall have 18 original jurisdiction in habeas corpus and other extraordinary 19 writs where a Superior Court judge is incapacitated or is not 20 available to grant the writ, and in cases involving acts,

] either of commission or omission, whether misfeasance, malfeasance or 2 non-feasance, of any Superior Court judge, and in cases of impeachment of inferior Court judges. The Superior Court shall be a 3 court of record and shall have original jurisdiction in all cases 4 both civil and criminal, except impeachment, arising under this 5 6 Constitution and the laws of the State of Alaska. The Chief 7 Justice, or in event of his absence, incapacity or non-availability 8 then the next ranking Associate Justice, of the Supreme Court may 9 assign, whenever reasonable exigency of juridical work and the 10 best interests of litigants require, a Superior Court judge to 11 try cases in other than the judicial district for which he is 12 appointed.

13 3. All justices and judges shall be citizens of the United 14 States and of the State of Alaska, and, also, except inferior 15 Court judges, practicing attorneys at law; otherwise, the Legis-16 lature shall prescribe the respective qualifications of all 17 justices and judges, fix their respective compensations, and their 18 respective retirement ages; and shall, also, prescribe the tenure 19 of office of Inferior Court judges. All justices and judges shall 20 be appointed by the Governor but they shall be selected by him 21 from not less than two nominees for each respective judicial 22 office nominated upon a non-partisan, non-political basis by the 23 Alaska Bar Association or its successor. Supreme Court Justices 24 and Superior Court Judges shall each be appointed during good 25 behavior and for life until they reach the retirement age; but,

- 2 -

1

1 6.

each at the end of his first seven years of judicial tenure 1 2 shall stand for election to his respective judicial office 3 at the then next following general election. Should he fail of election by a majority vote of the qualified electors. 14 5 in the case of Supreme Court Judges, of the State of Alaska 6 and, in case of Superior Court Judges, of the respective 7 judicial district for which he is appointed, his term of 8 office shall immediately cease and he shall not be eligible 9 for reappointment to any judicial office for a period of 10 three years. In such event his successor shall be appointed 11 and selected as hereinbefore provided.

11

12 Impeachment proceedings against any Supreme Court Justice 4. 13 or Superior Court Judge may be initiated for cause by either 14 the lower House of the Legislature or by the Alaska Bar Associa-15 tion or its successor, and shall be tried before the Senate of 16 the Legislature, at which hearing the accused may be represented 17 by counsel. A two-thirds vote of the Senate shall be required 18 to impeach a judge. Upon such vote the term of office of the 19 accused shall immediately end. Inferior Court judges may be 20 removed for cause by the Supreme Court upon complaint of one 21 or more Superior Court judges or of the Alaska Bar Association 22 or its successor. A vacancy in the office of any justice or 23 judge by impeachment or otherwise shall be filled by appointment and selection as hereinbefore provided. 24

25 5. Trial of all civil cases, unless waived, involving

1 \$500 or more shall be by jury of twelve and shall be heard 2 in the judicial district wherein it arose; but, the Legislature may provide for alternate jurors and for verdict to be returned 3 4 by less than the full jury of twelve. Trial of all crimes, unless waived and except in cases of Impeachment and in cases 5 6 of such petit crimes as the Legislature may ordain, shall be 7 by jury of twelve. All criminal cases, except impeachment. 3 shall be tried in the judicial district wherein the accused 9 resides, unless waived. Jurors may be either men or women 10 of such qualification as the Legislature may ordain. No fact 11 tried by a jury shall be otherwise re-examined in any court 12 in the State of Alaska than according to the rules of the 13 common law. Excessive bail shall not be required, nor excessive 14 fines imposed, nor cruel and unusual punishments inflicted.

Referred to Committee on Judiciary Branch

November 21, 1955

Constitutional Convention of Alaska

1

10

PROPOSAL NO. 12

Introduced by Edward V. Davis

Pertaining to that section of the constitution relative to the establishment of the Judicial Branch of the government of the State of Alaska. RESOLVED, that the following be agreed upon as part of the Alaska State Constitution.

Section I

2 1. The Judicial power of the State of Alaska shall be vested
3 in a supreme court, a district court and in such inferior courts
4 as the legislature may establish from time to time.

5 2. The several courts of the State of Alaska shall have
6 original and appellate jurisdiction as may be provided by law.
7 Inferior courts and their jurisdiction may be established,
8 altered or abolished from time to time by law as the need thereof
9 may arise.

Section II

11 The Supreme Court of Alaska shall be the highest court of 12 the State and shall exercise appellate jurisdiction as the 13 court of last resort of the state in civil and criminal matters. 14 It shall consist of not less than three justices and until 15 otherwise provided by the legislature the number of such justices 16 shall be three. The Justices of the Supreme Court shall elect one 17 of their number to preside as Chief Justice in such manner and

j.

1 under such terms and conditions as they may provide by rules and regulations to be adopted by them. The Supreme Court is hereby 2 empowered to make rules and regulations governing the administra-3 tion of the other courts of the State, and governing the practice 4 and procedure in civil and criminal cases in all of the courts 5 6 Any rules of practice and procedure adopted by of the state. 7 the Supreme Court pursuant to authority here given shall have the force and effect of law until and unless they are changed by vote 8 9 of at least two-thirds of both houses of the legislature and such 10 change approved by the governor, and thereafter except as so 11 changed.

- 2 -

Section III

13 The District Court shall be a court of general jurisdiction, 14 throughout the state, in civil and in criminal matters. It shall 15 have such other and further powers and duties as may be provided 16 by law. It shall operate under the general supervision of the 17 Supreme Court and according to rules of practice and procedure 18 to be prescribed by the Supreme Court.

19 Until otherwise provided by law the number of District Judges 20 shall be four. Such Judges shall serve for such term as may be 21 prescribed by law and according to assignment to be made by the 22 Supreme Court from time to time as the need shall arise.

23

12

Section IV

As used in this Article the word "Judge" shall include Justices of the Supreme Court of Alaska, Judges of the District Court of Alaska and all Judges of the inferior or subordinate Courts
 which may be prescribed by the legislature. The word "Judge"
 likewise shall be deemed to include the feminine gender as well
 as the masculine and the plural as well as the singular
 wherever applicable.

6

(

Section V

7 All Judges of the State of Alaska shall be appointed on a 8 nonpartisan basis from the best available candidates. Such Judges 9 likewise shall be continued as Judges subject to periodic elections 10 to be conducted by separate ballot and on a nonpartisan basis. 11 Details of such appointment and tenure of office are to be provided by law. Among other things such law is to provide for all Judges 12 13 of Alaska to be appointed by the governor of Alaska from a panel of 14 names of eligible persons to be furnished to the governor by a 15 Judicial council. Such Judicial council is to be composed of at 16 least two members appointed by the governor from the public at 17 large by and with the consent of the Senate, and of at least two 18 members named by the Alaska Bar Association or its successor. 19 The membership of the Judicial council may be increased from time 20 to time but the number of members to be appointed from the public 21 at large and the number of members to be named by the Alaska Bar Association shall always remain equal. The Chief Justice of the 22 23 Supreme Court, after his appointment and qualification, shall be 24 an ex-officio member of the Judicial council. All Judges after 25 appointment, and at a time and in a manner to be prescribed by

- 3 -

the legislature, shall stand election. Under such procedure, a majority of the persons voting at a general election may vote to retain or to reject such Judges. The law shall prescribe a manner for periodic elections as to retention or rejection of such judges depending on the terms prescribed by law for such Judges.

- 4 -

Section VI

7 No Justice of the Supreme Court and no Judge of the District Court shall hold any other office or position of profit under the 8 9 State of Alaska or the United States of America. This prohibition 10 shall not be construed to prevent such parties from performing such administrative duties as may be assigned by the Supreme Court 11 12 and shall not disqualify the Chief Justice of the Supreme Court 13 from serving as a member of the Judicial council as herein 14 provided.

15

6

Section VII

16 No person shall be eligible to hold the office of Justice of 17 the Supreme Court or District Judge unless he shall have been 18 admitted to practice law before the Supreme Court of Alaska for 19 a period of at least five years before his appointment or who has 20 not been engaged in the active practice of law for at least three 21 of the last five years before such appointment. Admission to 22 practice law, and the practice of law, in the Courts of the 23 Territory of Alaska for the prescribed periods or a combination 24 of such Territorial and State practice for such time shall be 25 deemed to satisfy the requirements of this section.

i	
	- 5 -
l	Section VIII
2	Any Justice of the Supreme Court or any Judge of the District
3	Court who shall become a candidate for any elective public office
l. _F	shall thereby forfeit his Judicial office.
5	Section IX
6	Justices of the Supreme Court and Judges of the District
7	Court shall not, while in office, engage in the practice of law.
8	Other Judges may engage in the practice of law subject to such
9	limitations and restrictions as may be provided by law.
10	Section X
11	Judges shall receive for their services such compensation as
12	may be provided by law from time to time. Such compensation shall
13	not be decreased as to any Judge during his term in office.
14	Section XI
15	Judges shall be subject to any applicable retirement law
16	of the State of Alaska and shall be retired at the age pre-
17	scribed by such law. This section shall not prevent the utili-
18	zation of retired Judges as Judges or Judicial officers under
19	temporary assignment by the Supreme Court.
20	Section XII
21	Whenever the Supreme Court shall certify to the governor that
22	it appears that any Judge of Alaska is so incapacitated, either
23	mentally or physically, as to substantially prevent him from per-
24	forming his duties, the governor shall appoint a commission of
25	three persons to inquire into the circumstances. On the

· 9

i

(

(

recommendation of such commission the governor may retire such Judge from office on such pension as may be provided by law. Section XIII Any Judge of Alaska shall be subject to impeachment in the same manner and with like effect as provided in this constitution, or as may be provided by law, as to other officers of the State of Alaska. Any Judge so impeached shall not exercise his office

8 until acquitted.

- 6 -

(

Constitutional Convention Delegate Proposal No. 22 Referred to Committee on Judiciary Branch November 25, 1955

Constitutional Convention of Alaska PROPOSAL NO. 22 Introduced by Warren A. Taylor

JUDICIAL BRANCH

RESOLVED, that the following be agreed upon as part of the Alaska State Constitution:

Sect. 1 The Judicial power of the State of Alaska shall be vested in one Supreme Court, one Superior Court, Probate Courts, and Justices of the Peace. Probate Courts and Justices of the Peace may be combined in one judge. The Legislature may also establish courts, for municipal purposes only, in incorporated cities and towns.

7 Sect. 2 The Supreme Court shall consist of a Chief Justice and 5 two associate Judges, a majority of whom shall constitute a quorum; 9 provided that the Legislature, by a majority of all the members 10 elected to each branch thereof, may provide for the election of 11 two additional associate justices, and if so increased three shall 12 constitute a quorum. The concurrence of a majority of the whole 13 court shall be necessary to render a decision.

Sect. 3 The justices of Supreme Court and Superior Court shall be appointed by the Governor of the State by appointing one of three persons possessing the qualifications for such office, who shall be nominated and whose names shall be submitted to the Governor by non-partisan judicial commission established and organized as hereinafter provided.

PROPOSAL NO. 22

-2-

Sect. 4 Tenure of Judges--Declaration of Candidacy--

]

2 Form of Judicial Ballot - Rejection and Retention 3 Sach Judge appointed pursuant to the provisions of Section 3, hereof, shall hold office in a term ending December 31st 4 following the next general election after the expiration of 5 6 twelve months in the office. Not less than sixty days prior to the holding of the general election next preceding the expiration 7 Ś of his term of office, any judge whose office is subject to the 9 provisions hereto may file in the office of the Secretary of State 10 a declaration of Candidacy for election to succeed himself. lſ 11 such declaration is not so filed by any judge, the vacancy result-12 ing from the expiration of his term of office shall be filled 13 by appointment as herein provided. If such declaration is filed, 14 his name shall be submitted at the next general election to the 15 votors eligible to vote within the geographic jurisdictional 16 limit of his court, or Superior Court if his office is that of a 17 Superior Judge, on a separate judicial ballot, without party 18 designation, which ballot shall state that the said judge seeks 19 to be retained in office for the term of his particular office 20 as herein provided. If a majority of those voting on the question 21 vote against retaining him in office, a vacancy shall exist which 22 shall be filled by appointment as provided herein; otherwise, said 23 judge shall, unless removed for cause, remain in office for the 24 number of years after December 31st following such election as is 25 provided for the full term of such office, and at the expiration PROPOSAL NO. 22

of each such term shall be eligible for retention in office by
 election in the manner herein prescribed.

3 Sect. 5 Terms of Judges: Judges of the Supreme Court shall 4 be selected for terms of nine years and Superior Courts for terms 5 of seven years. Judges of probate, justice and magistrate courts 6 shall hold office for such terms as shall be established by law. 7 Sect. 6 Qualifications - age limit - legal training and 8 experience: Judges of the Supreme Court shall have been citizens ç of the United States for at least fifteen years and shall have 10 been residents and qualified voters of this state for ten years 11 next preceding their selection. Such judges shall be at least 12 thirty-five years of age and shall have been in the general 13 practice of law for ten years, five years of which shall have 14 been in the courts of this state. Such judges shall not continue to hold office after attaining the age of seventy years. Superior 15 16 Court judges shall have been citizens of the United States for 17 at least twelve years and qualified voters of this state for 18 six years next preceding their selection, and be not less than 19 thirty years of age and residents of the judicial district to 20 which they shall be appointed. They shall have been in the 21 general practice of law for a period of eight years next pre-22 coding their solection, five of which shall have been in the 23 courts of the Territory of Alaska or the State of Alaska. The 24 appointment age, qualifications, term of office and removal of Justices of the Peace, Judges of Probate and Magistrates shall 25 PROPOSAL NO. 22

-3-

1 be established by law.

Sect. 7 Retirement of Judges: Any judge of a court of record 2 or magistrate who is unable to discharge the duties of his office 3 with efficiency by reason of continued illness or physical or 4 mental infirmity shall be retired from the office by order of a 5 committee composed of two judges of the Supreme Court and three 6 superior judges, after notice and a fair hearing and on a finding 7 of three-fifths of the committee that the disability is permanent. Ś 9 The judge so retired shall receive one-half his regular compensation until the end of his term of office. The Supreme Court shall 10 11 prescribe rules of procedure under this section.

-4-

Sect. 7 (Alternative Lethod of Retiring Judges for Disability) 12 Whenever the Supreme Court shall certify to the Governor that it 13 appears that any Justice of the Supreme Court or Judge of the 14 15 Superior Court is so incapacitated as substantially to prevent 16 him from performing his judicial duties, the Governor shall appoint 17 a commission of three persons to inquire into the circumstances, 18 and, on their recommendation that the said judge is incapable of 19 efficiently performing his judicial duties, the Bovernor shall retire the Justice or Judge from office, on pension as may be 20 21 provided by law.

22 Sect. & Impeachment: The Justices of the Supreme Court and 23 the Judges of the Superior Court shall be subject to impeachment, 24 and any judicial officer impeached shall not exercise his office 25 until accuitted.

PROPOSAL NO. 22

1 Sect. 9 (Salary of Judges): The Justices of the Supreme Court and the Judges of the Superior Court shall receive for their 2 services such salaries as may be provided by law, which shall not 3 be diminished during the term of their appointment. They shall not, 4 while in office, engage in the practice of law or other gainful 5 6 pursuit. They shall hold no other office or position of profit under this state or the United States. Any Justice or Judge who 7 shall become a candidate for an elective public office shall g thereby forfeit his judicial office. 9

Sect. 10 The Chief Justice of the Supreme Court shall be the Administrative head of the courts of the state. He may assign judges from one Judicial District to another for temporary service.
With the approval of the Supreme Court he shall appoint an administrative director to serve at his pleasure.

Sect. 11 Promulgation of Rules: The Supreme Court shall 15 16 establish rules of practice and procedure for all courts. The 17 rules shall not change substantive rights, or the law relating to 18 evidence, the oral examination of witnesses, juries, the right 19 of trial by jury, of the right of appeal. The Court shall publish 20 the rules and fix a day on which they take effect, but no rule shall take effect before six months after its publication. Any 21 rule may be annulled or amended by a law limited to that purpose. 22 Sect. 12 (Jurisdiction of Supreme Court): The Bupreme Court 23 shall have exclusive appellate jurisdiction in all cases involv-24 ing the construction of the Constitution of the United States or of 25 PROPOSAL NO. 22

-5-

1 this state, the validity of a treaty or statute of the United 2 States, or any authority exercised under the laws of the United States, the construction of the revenue laws of this state, the 3 title to any office under this state, the title to real estate, 4 in all civil cases where the state or political subdivision of 5 6 the state or any state officer as such is a party, in all cases of felony, in all other classes of cases provided by law and until 7 otherwise provided by law, on all cases where the amount in 8 dispute, exclusive of costs, exceeds the sum of three thousand 9 10 dollars.

Sect. 13 (Jurisdiction of Superior Courts): The Superior Courts shall have jurisdiction over all criminal cases not otherwise provided by law, exclusive jurisdiction in all civil cases not otherwise provided for by law, and concurrent and appellate jurisdiction as provided by law. The Superior Courts shall sit at times and places in each judicial district as prescribed by law.

18 Sect. 14 Judicial Districts (Establishment): The state
19 shall be divided into three judiaial districts, which, until
20 revised or amended by law shall be constituted as follows:

Judicial District No. One shall consist of that part of the state situated in what is known as Division No. One; Judicial Division No. Two shall consist of that part of the state situated in what are known as Divisions Nos. Two and Four; and Judicial Division No. Three shall consist of that part of the state PROPOSAL NO. 22

-6-

1 situated in what is known as Division No. Three. That the 2 headquarters of the Superior Court for the First Judicial District 3 shall be at Juneau, Alaska, and one judge shall be assigned thereto; that the headquarters of Judicial District Number Two shall be at 4 5 Fairbanks, Alaska, and two judges shall be assigned thereto; that 6 the headquarters of Judicial District No. Three shall be at 7 Anchorage, Alaska, and two judges shall be assigned thereto. 3 The judges shall hold court from time to time in other localities 9 within their judicial districts, when in their opinion, the same 10 will promote justice, and expedite litigation. The Judicial 11 Districts may be changed or abolished by law as public convenience 12 may require, but no judge shall be removed thereby from office 13 during his term. Any Superior Judge may sit in another judicial 14 district at the request of a judge thereof, or upon the direction of the Chief Justice of the Supreme Court. 15

16 Sect. 15 Judicial Commission: There shall be established a non-17 partisan commission whose duty it shall be to nominate and submit 18 to the Governor, names of persons for appointment to fill vacancies 19 in the Supreme Court and Superior Court. The Judicial Commission 20 shall consist of seven members, one of whom shall be the Chief 21 Justice of the Supreme Court who shall act as chairman, and the 22 remaining six members shall be chosen in the following manner: The 23 members of the bar of this state residing in each Judicial District 24 shall elect one of their number to serve as a member of said 25 commission, and the Governor shall appoint one PROPOSAL NO. 22

-7-

1 citizen, not a member of the bar, from the residents of each 2 judicial district; the term of office of the members of such 3 commission shall be fixed by the Supreme Court and may be changed 4 from time to time, but not so as to shorten or lengthen the term 5 of any member then in office. No member of any such commission 6 other than the chairman shall hold any public office, and no 7 member shall hold any official position in a political party. 8 Such commission shall act only by concurrence of a majority of 9 its members. The members of said commission shall receive no 10 salary for their services, but they shall receive their necessary 11 traveling and other expenses or per diem incurred while actually 12 engaged in the discharge of their official duties. All elections 13 provided for under this section shall be held and regulated, under 14 such rules as the Supreme Court shall promulgate. 15 Sect. 16 (Review of Action of Administrative Agencies):

16 All final decisions, findings, rules and orders of any administra-17 tive officer or body existing under the Constitution or by law, 18 which are judicial or quasi-judicial and affect private rights, 19 shall be subject to direct review by the courts as provided by 20 law; and such review shall include the determination whether the 21 same are authorized by law, and in cases in which a hearing is 22 required by law, whether the same are supported by competent and 23 substantial evidence upon the whole record.

Sect. 17 (Election of Chief Justice): The Justices of the Supreme
Court shall elect a Chief Justice to preside over the court en banc.

-8-

THE INSTITUTE OF JUDICIAL ADMINISTRATION, INC.

OFFICERS:

President: ARTHUR T. VANDERBILT Vice-President: SHELDEN D. ELLIOTT Secretary: DELMAR KARLEN Treasurer: MIGUEL A. DE CAPRILES

January 9, 1955

DIRECTOR:

SHELDEN D. ELLIOTT, 40 Washington Square South New York 12, New York Telephone: SPring 7-2000 Extension 8080

William A. Egan, President Alaska Constitutional Convention University of Alaska College, Alaska

Dear Mr. Egan:

I am in receipt of your telegram requesting me to send any suggested drafting or substantive changes in the Committee Proposal on the Judiciary Article, or additional topics which should be covered therein. I have also received a copy of the Committee Proposal as amended on second reading.

After a careful study of the proposal in its present form, I am convinced that it represents a model of which Alaska or any other American state could well be proud. If adopted as it now stands, it will assure that Alaska is in the forefront of states complying with the requirements of a modern and efficient judicial system. There are no suggested changes or additions which I could offer to improve it, and I am most hopeful that it will be finally approved in its present form.

With all best wishes,

Sincerely yours,

Shelden D. E.

Director

WILLIAM V. BOGGESS ATTORNEY AT LAW 213-215 NERLAND BUILDING FAIRBANKB, ALASKA

December 1, 1955

Dr. 15/55

George M. McLaughlin, Chairman Committee on Judiciary Branch Constitutional Convention College, Alaska

Gentlemen:

Any proposed method for the selection of Supreme Court justices should be carefully reviewed in the light of four agreed objectives:

- 1. That the Bench be non-partisan in composition--or, perhaps more correctly--able to administer justice without political obligation; and
- 2. That the Bench be able to deal competently with diverse problems arising from the economic and social differences between one area of Alaska and another; and
- 3. That the Bench be composed of able lawyers having judicial temperaments; and
- 4. That the Bench be completely independent of the Executive and Legislative branches of the State government.

The following outline of method for selection is submitted for your consideration in light of those objectives:

- 1. That the Legislature be empowered to divide the State into an even number of judicial election districts, subject to the limitation that such districts shall at no time exceed eight in number.
- 2. That the voters of each such district elect a district justice to the Supreme Court and the voters of the State at large a chief justice.
- 3. That the candidates for district justice, at least two in number, be selected by vote of the practicing attorneys in each such district and the candidates for chief justice, at least two in number, be selected by vote of the practicing attorneys of the State. A justice would automatically be a candidate for re-election unless he declared otherwise.
- 4. That the term of office for justice and chief justice be seven years. The first chief justice elected would hold office for a term of seven years and the remaining justices for terms of six years. five years, etc. as determined by lot.

5. That the ballot for justice or chief justice not indicate party affiliation.

The foregoing outline is skeletal only and for the purpose of brevity does not touch upon such important considerations as age, residence, citizenship and length of practice qualifications for judgeship.

It is submitted that if such a method is employed the objective above-stated will be realized for the following reasons:

- 1. Judges selected by the Bar and elected by the people on a nonpartisan basis may assume office without political obligation. Lawyers themselves in exercising their privilege of selection will carefully minimize the candidate's political affiliations. Lawyers demand justice of the courts and a Republican lawyer does not decline the retainer of a Democratic client.
- 2. By reason of district representation, the Bench, in any case, will have one member who is conversant with the economic and social conditions of the area in which such case arose.
- 3. The Bench will be composed of men of judicial temperament. The good trial lawyer, the good after-dinner speaker or the good-time Charlie will not necessarily make a good judge. An appellate judge must be honest, must possess a sound, basic knowledge of the law, must be devoted thereto, must be studious and diligent, and must have courage to extend principles of law to new factsituations tempered by enough caution not to destroy the predictability of the law. Who is better able to determine the existence of such qualifications in a proposed candidate than the lawyers themselves through their constant association with him in the practice of law?
- 4. Under the proposed method the maximum membership of the Bench would be nine justices. Independence from Executive or Legislative threats to pack the Bench with new members more kindly disposed towards current ideas of political expediency could thus be assured.

Respectfully submitted,

lleaul Brages

Kokhanok Bay, Alaska November 25, 1955

Hon. George McLaughlin, Chairman, Judicuary Committee, Alaska Constitutional Convention, College, Alaska.

Dear Mr. McLaughlin;

I should like to respectfully invite the attention of your committee to a need in our judicuary which is, in my opinion and experience, both timely and pressing.

In my experience as U. S. Commissioner, and in the experiences of other Commissioners from other areas of the Third Division with whom I have conversed, all too frequently there is little actual justice meted out in the inferior courts.

This is particularly true in cases involving game violations where the defendant is Native - this being the most general type of case in my experience. The defendant often understands very little English. He is in trouble, and his only desire is to please the Court thereby hoping to reduce the punishment he expects.

Quite aside from the obvious fact that in such cases the defendant cannot be truely said to have had his day in court, such a system has a far more serious impact in a sociological sense. The Native is frightened of the White law. He doesn't understand it and cannot grasp the abstract notions behind the complex laws which he must obey - or be punished.

I respectfully submit that every such incident tends to drive a wedge between our 34,000 Native people and the eventual integration they will make into our, the dominant society. In my Court, I have made a practice of telling the Natives that the law is simply a set of rules by which we govern our own conduct. The game warden can no more violate those laws than can the defendant - this in the face of the fact that game wardens, particularly those zealous youngsters anxious to make a reputation, have been known to violate even the sacred rights we all enjoy under the U. S. Constitution.

Since this is a universal problem faced by every inferior (and District) Court, I submit that it would be wholly proper for the Committee to consider including the system of Public Defender within the Judicial section of the Alaska Constitution.

Since the Public Defender would act only in cases where indigent defendants were involved, there could be no question of "socialized law". But by providing a proper defence, the State, which as assumed the duty of prosecution, would be truely be assuming a man innocent until proven guilty. I am not an attorney. And in isolated precincts where the new equivelant to the present Commissioner is not an attorney, there should be no need for that qualification to exist for the Defender.

I would appreciate it if you would also advise my Delegate, Mr. Emberg, as to the decision of your Committee.

Respectfully, Lon R. Moore

United States District Court Second Division, Territory of Alaska Judge's Chambers Nome

> At Ketchikan November 23, 1955

(

Mr. George M. McLaughlin Chairman, Committee on the Judiciary Branch Constitutional Convention College, Alaska

Dear George:

Received your circular letter welcoming the recommendations of the District Judges, amongst others, concerning the provisions of the judiciary article in the proposed new constitution for the State of Alaska.

I had discussed this subject at some length Nome with Mr. Tom Stewart, Executive Secretary at of the Alaska Statehood Committee, and with Mr. Schaffer, member of the Chicago firm engaged in making studies to submit to the convention, and I am in accord with the suggestion then made that the judiciary consist of a Supreme Court of not less than three judges, and Superior Courts to be established in not less than five judicial districts; also, that the maximum number of such districts be not expressly limited by the constitution so as to allow for possible expansion by action of the legislature as conditions may warrant. I had suggested not less than five, believing that there should be two such districts in what is now known as the Third Judicial Division. suggesting one with headquarters at Anchorage and another with headquarters at Seward, which latter district could include Kodiak, Bristol Bay and the Alaska Peninsula and Aleutian Chain.

The Superior Courts should have, in my opinion, original jurisdiction in all matters civil or criminal, except matters coming within the jurisdiction of the U. S. District Courts, that is such matters as Admiralty or involving any federal question, and expressly including probate jurisdiction, for I find that it is well known that the exercise of probate jurisdiction by the U. S. Commissioners as ex officio probate judges is a most

Walter H. Hodge District Judge

-

ia N Page 2 Mr. George M. McLaughlin

difficult task for them unless they are trained lawyers, and is not wholly satisfactory. It would be my opinion, however, that juvenile problems may be left with the Commissioners because of the local aspect of such problems and because the Commissioners, so far as I am aware, have been doing a very good job in that respect.

(· (.

I do protest the suggestion of Mr. Schaffer that justice courts should be abolished, which would place the entire burden of all litigation, including petty criminal offenses and small claims in civil actions, upon the Superior Courts, which would be needlessly oppressive and would not give proper service to litigants in communities outside of the location of the Superior Courts. In fact I believe that such justice courts should be preserved and established by the constitution, setting up precincts as may be ordered by the District Judges as is now the practice. It may well be, however, that the jurisdiction of such justice courts may extend to municipalities thereby eliminating magistrates courts; but I have not made a study of this matter and do not wish to express an opinion thereon at this time.

As to the manner of election or appointment of judges, I believe that the system adopted by some states, as proposed, of nomination by attorneys in each district to the governor of a list of candidates and appointment by the governor from such list is a good one. I rather doubt, however, the advisability of any lifetime tour of duty, especially if there be no provision for compulsory retirement at a certain age, for I feel that there are certain abuses arising from such system and suggest that such appointment be for a specified term, but that four years is a rather brief time, as any attorney so elevated to the bench must give up his practice to accept such judicial appointment, and suggest that a term of six years such as now prevails in Hawaii would be more just.

Trusting that these suggestions may be helpful, I remain

Sincerely yours,

Naeta 14. Hodges

Walter H. Hodge District Judge

TWENTY-SECOND SESSION ALASKA TERRITORIAL LEGISLATURE HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

Sunday morning--

Dear Ed:

John Hughes gave me a copy of your Proposal No. 12 and asked me to give you my comments. I think the Proposal as a whole is very good. Could make the following personal sugestions:

Section II. Election of a Chief Justice by the other two might lead to some jealousy and ill-feeling on the Court. Illinois provided that the C.J. shall rotate each two years by seniority. Why not just say that "One member, selected for in such manner as the legislature shall provide, shall serve as Chief Justice of t he Court".

Section II. Why should it take 2/3 of the legislature to change the Rules? In actual practice it is unlikely that the legislature would fiddle with the rules very often--; you have no idea what a struggle it is to get even a very meritorious bill through, because of the apathy of the lay members toward technical legal problems. However, if a change is really needed a simple majority should be sufficient. Generally, I think limitations of the majority in such instances are bad.

Section III. I think we are going to need five district judges right off the bat. We do now. Do you feel that the power of assignment as you have it is broad enough to cover assignment of a D.J. to the Sup. Ert. temporarily, and vice versa? If not, I think it should be.

Page 3, Line 12: change "is to" to "shall". Line 14: strike words "names of". Line 15: strike "is to"and substitute "shall". The last sentence of the section duplicates the second sentence and they could be easily combined.

Section XI: Personally I think it would be better to permit retirement rather than require it.

These are merely suggestions, and again, the general plan is very good. With best wishes--

PS: Why get into a hassle over the unicameral legislature. Would seem better to go b8cameral as a matter of general acceptance and let the unicameral come up later if there is popular demand.

uncerely -wender

W.

M. E. MONAGLE, PRESIDENT, JUNEAU CHAS, J. CLASBY, IST VICE-PRES., FAIRBANKS EDWARD V. DAVIS, 2ND VICE-PRES., ANCHORAGE JOHN R. CONNOLLY, SECRETARY, ANCHORAGE BOARD OF GOVERNORS ALASKA BAR ASSOCIATION P. O. BOX 279 ANCHORAGE, ALASKA

BOARD MEMBERS N. C. BANFIELD CHAS. J. CLASBY CHAS. L. CLOUDY JOHN R. CONNOLLY EDWARD V. DAVIS GEORGE B. GRIGSBY JULIEN A. HURLEY M. E. MONAGLE JAMES A. VON DER HEYDT

November 21, 1955

George M. McLaughlin, Chairman Committee on the Judiciary Branch Constitutional Convention College, Alaska

Dear Mr. McLaughlin:

In response to your letter of November 16, 1955, with regard to recommendations concerning the provisions of the judiciary article in the proposed State Constitution, the Board of Governors of the Alaska Bar Association recommends the following:

> "That a judicial system be created which consists of a supreme court, superior courts of general jurisdiction and inferior courts of limited jurisdiction; and that the Judges of all courts be selected according to the American Bar Association plan modified to meet local conditions."

> > Very truly yours,

John R. Connolly, Secretary Board of Governors Alaska Bar Association

ed cc: M.E.Monagle

.

.

ATTORNEY AT LAW

FAIRBANKS, ALASKA

November 18, 1955



Mr. George M. McLaughlin, Chairman Committee on the Judiciary Branch Constitutional Convention College, Alaska

Dear Sir:

Respectfully submitted herein are the recommendations of the undersigned, relative to the establishment of the Judiciary for the State of Alaska.

a) Judges of the Supreme Court, and lesser judges, should be elected by the people for terms not exceeding a period of eight years, with provision for recall by the legislature for misfeasance, nonfeasance, malfeasance, or illness.

b) The right to elect the executive, the legislative, and the judiciary, in any state, should never be withdrawn from the hands of the people. All officers of the state stand in the same position - all are human beings, and subject to the frailties of all human beings, by reason of health or otherwise. One branch is equally as important as the others, and presumably, each has identical power; however, in dealing with the most intimate human affairs, it is never wise to permit control to be exercised by appointed officials who may, by reason of position or influence not commensurate with their ability, burrow their way into a position of high importance, where removal may only be obtained by impeachment.

c) Within recent weeks, there has been brought into sharp focus before the public in Alaska the feelings of the judiciary when criticized by the practicing members of the Ear Association. Yet, competent criticism may only be felt through the Ear Association, whose members deal practically with the judiciary, and are in constant intimate touch therewith.

d) There are various political theories which are reflected through the appointment of the judiciary. For these political theories to be directed through the hands of a few, whoever they may be, is unsound and unwise. The effects of feudal servitude have long been felt through the appointment of officials by financial groups, whose interests are only financial, and whose motives are selfish.

e) It is the unqualified opinion of the undersigned that the section of the judiciary of our sovereign state, as well as the executive and legislative, should at all times rest finally and irrevocably in the hands of the voters.

Respectfully submitted PARRISH

RAP:PEW

November 16, 1955

Fresident, Alaska Bar Association Juneau, Alaska

Dear Sir:

The Committee on the Judiciary Branch of the Constitutional Convention now in session at College, Alaska welcomes recommendations from interested persons concerning the provisions of the judiciary article in the proposed State Constitution.

The Committee requests that recommendations be presented in person or in writing prior to the first day of December, 1955.

Very truly yours,

nchaughlin

George M. McLaughlin Chairman Committee on the Judiciary Branch Constitutional Convention College, Alaska

Copies: Each District Judge Bar Associations of Anchorage, Fairbanks, Juneau, Ketchikan Each United States Attorney Each Attorney at Law Each U. S. Commissioner